



MICHIGAN
HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
P.O. Box 30014
LANSING, MICHIGAN 48909-7514

Minutes of the House Standing Committee
on
Education Reform

Thursday, May 25, 2017

9:00 a.m.

Room 521 House Office Building

The House Standing Committee on Education Reform was called to order by Representative Tim Kelly, Chair.

The Clerk called the roll; members present were **Representatives Kelly, Hornberger, Crawford, Garcia, Roberts, Alexander, Griffin, Lilly, Noble, Reilly, Zemke, Brinks, Chang, Camilleri, and Sowerby. (15/15)**

The Clerk announced that a quorum was present.

The Chair laid before the committee the minutes of May 18, 2017 as printed.

Representative Lilly moved to adopt the minutes of May 18, 2017, as printed.

There being no objection the motion prevailed by unanimous consent of the members present; the minutes were adopted as printed.

The Chair laid before the committee House Bill s 4425 and 4426.

HB 4425 (Barrett)

Health; immunizations; promulgation of certain rules by the department of health and human services that are more stringent than the vaccination exemptions provided in statute and that exclude individuals from school as a disease control measure; prohibit.

HB 4426 (Noble)

Education; attendance; promulgation of certain rules that are more stringent than the requirements for claiming exemption from immunizations; prohibit.

Representative Barrett, the bill sponsor for House Bill 4425, explained the bill and introduced Michael Ross, an Attorney representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice; Erin Mersino, a Senior Legal Counsel for the Great Lakes Justice Center, Attorney and Professor William Wagner,

President and Senior Legal Counsel for the Great Lakes Justice Center; and Joel Dorfman, a member of the Michigan for Vaccine Choice. Mr. Ross, Ms. Mersino, and Mr. Dorfman testified in support of the bills. Questions followed to the bill sponsor and testifiers. Copies of Ms. Merinso and Mr. Dorfman's handouts are attached.

Representative Noble, the bill sponsor for House Bill 4426, explained his bill, and responded to questions.

Brigit McQuiston testified in support of the bill. A copies of her written testimony and handouts are attached.

Dr. Rebecca Huizer, a Pediatrician, representing Michigan Vaccine Choice, testified in support of the bills.

Dr. Eden V. Wells, Chief Medical Executive, Michigan Department of Health and Human Services, testified in opposition to the bills, and responded to questions from committee members.

At 10:30 a.m., the Chair went at ease at the call of the Chair until committees are given leave to meet.

At 2:45 p.m., the Chair reconvened the committee.

The following submitted testimony cards wishing to speak, but were not present when the committee reconvened:

Marta Johnson, representing the Cooperative for Safe Kids, in opposition;

Levi Pulver*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Mandee Ordaz*, representing Michigan Vaccine, in support;

Patricia Neuenschwander*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Betty Gusho*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Abigail Noble* from Dorr, Michigan in support;

Alicia Stillman* of West Bloomfield, Michigan in opposition;

Mary Wisinski, representing Kent County Health Department, in opposition;

Shane Bies*. Administrator of Public Health Nursing Services at Oakland County Health Division, in opposition;

Leigh-Anne Stafford*, MSA, Health Officer for Oakland County Health Division, in opposition;

Sarah Hernandez, Registered Nurse with the Kent County Health Department, in opposition;

Andrea Klooster from Ann Arbor, Michigan in support;

Sylvia Rhodea*, representing Michigan Vaccine, in support;

Sarah Smith* from Pontiac, Michigan in opposition;

Tashi Schurzia, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Kelli Walinske from Harrison Township, Michigan in support;

Hani Alsaidi from Lansing in opposition;

Lynette Prentice, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Mel Corringan*, PhD, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support;

Allison Lucas, J.D. from Norton Shores, Michigan, in support; and
Rosalia Giannotti*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, in support.

*Submitted written testimony is attached.

Kate DeVries, Founder of the Cooperative for Safe Kids, testified in opposition to the bills.

Amy Zaagman, Executive Director for the Michigan Council for Maternal and Child Health, Dr. Sharon L. Swindell, Associate Professor of Pediatrics at University of Michigan, representing the Michigan Chapter of Academy of Pediatrics, Patricia Bednanz, representing the Michigan Association of School Nurses, and Dr. Jessie Marshall, Washtenaw County Public Health Medical Director, testified in opposition to the bills. Question followed.

Mary Anne Ramer, Beaumont Health, testified in opposition to the bills. Submitted written testimony is attached.

Dr. Anne E Suess, Pediatrician at Mason Pediatrics, testified in opposition of the bills.

Beth Bechtel, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice, testified in support of the bills.

Christina Zilke, Washtenaw County Public Health Immunization Coordinator and Public Health Nurse, testified in opposition to the bills. Questions followed.

Kelly and Ashley Genzlinger, testified in support of the bills, and answered questions.

Dr. Kevin O'Dell, Chiropractor, testified in support of the bills. Questions followed.

The following submitted testimony cards in support of the bills, but did not wish to testify:

Mary Kortz*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Erika Phillips, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Amelia Jones, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Lynn Culver*, from Clio, Michigan;
Joanne Harper, representing RN's for vaccine choice / Teachers for Vaccine Choice;
Lindsey Harper*, representing Pharmacists for Vaccine Choice;
Malia Vachow, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Jennifer Whitman, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Karen Keeley, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Amanda Holbert, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Sandra Betten*, representing Ottawa County;
Jeffrey A. Vachow, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Janette Avery, from Chelsea, Michigan;
Michael Resson, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Molly Rossow, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Mindy Vachow, representing Green Oak Township and Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Maria Myers, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
Debby Kaake-Zofko, representing Genesee County;

Sally J Geyer, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Owen Stolarczyk, of Kalkaska, Michigan;
 Karen L. Keeley, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Michael Demick, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Sara Demick*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Connie Johnson*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Denise Ritsema, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Marci Coffman, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Shawn Jenkins, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Kendra McCrimmon, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Tiffany Mentgen, representing her children's rights;
 Linsey Marcum*, representing precinct delegates and her children's rights;
 Dr. Allison C. Carlo, from East Lansing, Michigan;
 Kristin Lee, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Tina Parker, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Tracy Schnee, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Polly Corbett, from Grattan Township;
 Nicole Paquin, from Ann Arbor, Michigan;
 Jeremy Kelley, representing Parents for Vaccine Choice;
 Samantha Kelley, representing the Parents for Vaccine Choice;
 Natalie Schmaltz*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Shelley DeLisle, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Shawna Lubinski, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Helena Miller from Lansing, Michigan;
 Jessica Gliesman, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice.
 Elizabeth Mahoney-Funk, representing herself/future;
 Christa O'Dell, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Shaina Allen, representing herself and children everywhere;
 Illana Stern*, from West Bloomfield, Michigan;
 Jennifer Temple*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Carol Moore, from Birmingham, Michigan;
 Wendy Schweifer, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Rachel Middaugh*, from Livonia, Michigan;
 Jessica Tobin*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Robert Benko, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice;
 Angela Benko, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice; and
 Tami Schroeder*, representing Michigan for Vaccine Choice.

*Submitted written testimony is attached.

The following submitted testimony cards in opposition to the bills, but did not wish to testify:

Teresa Holtrop, representing herself;
 Teresa Emshwiller, representing herself;
 Kathryn Haley, from Grand Rapids;
 Melissa Tallman, from Grand Rapids;
 Hope Ramer;

Lauren Ramer;
 Geoff Ramer;
 Floriane Bishay representing the Oakland County Health Division;
 Melissa Lee, representing herself;
 Meggan Shell, representing herself;
 Komalben Palmae, representing herself;
 Brittany Plescher-Kenworthy, representing herself;
 Dr. Jessica Carney, representing herself;
 Simeen Khan, representing herself;
 Christine Honer, representing herself;
 Dr. Lindsay Huckabee, D.O., representing herself;
 Kayla Barnes, representing herself;
 Dr. Gita Gupta, M.D., representing herself;
 Dr. Amit Misra, M.D., representing himself;
 Dr. Stephanie Grondahl, representing herself and her children;
 Matthew Carter, representing himself and his four children;
 Julie Creighton, representing herself;
 Dr. Becca Justin, representing herself;
 Monnir Djemil, representing himself;
 Dr. Marc Zafferani, representing himself;
 Lauren Stady, representing herself;
 Stephanie Vanderstelt, representing herself;
 Reem Almomani, representing the pediatricians at Sparrow/MSU;
 Dr. Jagraj Singh Brar M.D., representing himself and all the children with MSU–
 Sparrow;
 Mohamed Hani Farhat, representing himself;
 Shiho Kutsuwada, from Okemos, Michigan;
 Dr. Mike Stiffler, MD, representing himself;
 Ira Holla, representing herself;
 Dr. Ala Elayyan representing himself;
 Jasmine Virk, from East Lansing, Michigan;
 Dr. Garrett Koon, representing himself;
 Sabrina Huq, from Kalamazoo, Michigan;
 Joseph D.J. Fakhoury, from Portage, Michigan;
 Cailly Howell, representing herself;
 Scottie Paitt, representing myself;
 Michael Schmalz, from Kalamazoo, Michigan;
 Rebecca Mastee, representing the Michigan Catholic Conference.
 Nicole Paquin, representing herself;
 Bob Kefgen, representing the Michigan Association of Secondary School Principals;
 Christin Nohner, representing the Michigan Academy of Family Physicians;
 Jerry Johnson, representing Barry, Branch, Calhoun, Jackson, Lenawee and Monroe
 Intermediate School Districts;
 Annalisa Greenworld, representing the Michigan Association of Intermediate School
 Administration;

Emily Laidlaw, representing Education Service Agencies;
 Mary Pollock, representing the American Association of University Women;
 Tobi Lyon Moore, Executive Director of the American Nurses Association of Michigan;
 Colin Ford, representing the Michigan State Medical Society;
 Rachel Richard, representing the Michigan League for Public Policy;
 Jennifer Smith*, representing the Michigan Association of School Boards;
 Mallory Reader, representing the Michigan Association of Non-Public Schools;
 Jill Sambaer, representing the Barry-Eaton District Health Department;
 Lisa Wegner, representing the Barry-Eaton District Health Department;
 Lisa Hahn, representing Oakland County and the Nursing Admission Assessment Form;
 Chara Sumeghy, representing PIN of Southfield, Michigan;
 Eric Liv, representing the Michigan Pharmacists Association;
 Deidia Wilson, representing McLaren Health Care Corporation;
 Caroline Castillo, from Howell, Michigan;
 Amy Gumbrecht, representing the Wayne County Department of Health;
 Heather Nicholoff, representing the Michigan Council of Nurse Practitioners;
 Meghan Swain, representing the Michigan Association for Local Public Health;
 Mike Swain, representing the Northern Michigan Public Health Alliance;
 Elizabeth Hertel, representing Trinity Health;
 Peter Spadafore, representing the Michigan Association of School Administrators;
 Dillon McGough, representing the Michigan Health and Hospital Association;
 Megan Petzko-Sweet, representing Beaumont Health;
 David Fowler, representing Branch-Hillsdale-St. Joseph Community Health Agency;
 Jennifer Hemberg, representing herself;
 Dr. Michael Anacker MD, representing himself;
 Erin Jones*, representing the March of Dimes.
 Shannon Taut, representing herself;
 Dr. Rebecca Lane MD, representing herself;
 August Trem, from East Grand Rapids, Michigan.
 Pei'-Lan Tson, representing the Cooperative for Safe Kids;
 Denise Sloan, representing the Michigan Academy Pediatrics;
 Chris Smith, representing the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC);
 Sean Gehle*, representing Ascension Michigan;
 Elizabeth Kutter*, representing Henry Ford Health System;
 Christine Shearer, representing the Michigan Association of Health Plans;
 Kevin McKinney, representing Michigan Osteopathic Association;
 Caroline Liethen, representing the Michigan Department of Education;
 Kathleen Merry, representing Wayne RESA;
 Lisa Hansknecht, representing Oakland Schools;
 Jennifer Hemberg, representing herself;
 Dr. Michael Anacker, M.D., representing himself;
 Elise Gross, M.D., representing herself;
 Annie Lu, representing herself;
 Ashley Cobb, representing herself;
 Colleen Mathis, M.D, representing herself;

Dr. Rebecca Lane, M.D., representing herself;
Dr. Chris Mathis, M.D., representing himself;
Dr. Sam Neher, M.D. representing himself;
Dr. Sarah McLaughlin, representing herself;
Dr. Kayla Bronner, M.D., M.P.H, representing herself;
Dr. Lauren Wozniak, M.D., M.P.H, representing herself;
Dr. Julie Banett, M.D., M.P.H, representing herself;
Dr. Rachel Smith, M.D., representing herself;
Andrew Jones, representing himself;
Dr. Razan Dafalla, representing himself;
Dr. Johnathan Gold, M.O. representing himself;
Brad Norat, representing himself;
Dr. Swetha Sriram, representing Children's Hospital of Michigan;
Lolia Abibi, representing herself;
Kristen Frane, representing herself;
Dr. Hayley Timm, M.D., representing herself;
Dr. Mary Alice Reinoehl, representing herself;
Dr. Tamara LaRue, representing herself;
Dr. Lyndsey Reynolds, representing herself;
Dr. David Synhorst, representing himself;
Dr. Lyndsey Reynolds, representing herself;
Dr. Lauren Azevedo, D.O., representing herself;
Dr. Christy Lawrence, D.O. representing herself; and
Mary MacLeod, representing herself.

*Submitted written testimony is attached.

The following people submitted written testimony, but did not wish to speak:

Sylvia in support;
Northern Michigan Public Health Alliance, in opposition;
Jill Fennessy, RN Tri County Area Schools, in opposition;
Christine Dailey BSN, RN, District Nurse for Tri County Area Schools, in opposition;
Dr. Leonard B. Johnson, MD, President-elect of the Michigan Infectious Diseases Society, President of the Medical Staff at St. John Hospital and Medical Center, and Professor at Wayne State University School of Medicine;
Carrie Langbo, from Richland, Michigan, in opposition;
Ken Bowen, Health Officer for Ionia County, in opposition;
Mark C. Navin, Ph.D., Associate Professor of Philosophy at Oakland University, in opposition;
Dawn Richardson, Director of Advocacy for the National Vaccine Information Center, in support; and
Dorit Reiss, Professor of Law at the University of California-Hastings College of Law, in opposition.

There being no other business before the committee; **Representative Chair declared the Committee adjourned**, the time being 4:01 p.m.

Tim Kelly, Chair
House Standing Committee on Education Reform

Joy Brewer, Committee Clerk

Date approved by the committee